Age, recruitment variability, and partial age validation of Coregonus kiyi from Lake Superior

Taylor A. Lepaka,1,\*, Derek H. Oglea,2, and Mark R. Vinsonb,3

a Department of Natural Resources, Northland College, Ashland, WI 54806, USA

b U. S. Geological Survey, Great Lakes Science Center, Lake Superior Biological Station, Ashland, Wisconsin 54806

1 E-mail: taylepak613@gmail.com

2 E-mail: dogle@northland.edu, Tel: 715-682-1300

3 E-mail: mvinson@usgs.gov, Tel: 715-682-6163

\*Corresponding author

Age, recruitment variability, and partial age validation of Coregonus kiyi from Lake Superior

**Abstract**

We compared the use of scales and otoliths to estimate the age of Lake Superior kiyi (*Coregonus kiyi*) and compared these age estimates to 12 years (2003-2014) of length frequency data to assess recruitment and to validate our age estimates. Ages estimated from otoliths were precise and were consistently older than ages estimated from scales. Maximum otolith derived ages were 20 for females and 12 for males. Age estimates showed high numbers of age 5, 9, and 11 fish, corresponding to the 2009, 2005, and 2003 year classes, respectively, which were also evident in the length frequency distributions. Recruitment was low to non-existent in other years. Ages estimated from otoliths are generally within one year of the true age of the fish, at least for fish age-5 and older, suggesting that kiyi age may be reliably estimated to within one year by careful examination of thin-sectioned otoliths.

**Keywords:** coregoninae; Laurentian Great Lakes; length frequency analysis; whitefish

**Introduction**

Kiyi (*Coregonus kiyi*) is one of eight cisco species (*C. alpenae, C. artedi, C. johannae, C. hoyi, C. nigripinnis, C. reighardi* and *C. zenithicus*) that historically existed in the Laurentian Great Lakes (Koelz, 1929). Kiyi were found in Lakes Huron, Michigan, Ontario, and Superior (Koelz, 1929), but presently only occur in Lake Superior. The demise of kiyi in the other Great Lakes is not well understood, but may have been due to increasing abundances of alewife (*Alosa pseudoharengus*) and rainbow smelt (*Osmerus mordax*) and overfishing (Christie, 1974). Kiyi is one of the least studied fishes in Lake Superior, despite being the most abundant deepwater (>100 m) pelagic species in a recent lakewide fish population survey (Yule et al., 2013).

Accurate age estimates are fundamental to understanding the life history and population dynamics of fish (Beamish & McFarlane, 1983). However, age estimation can be difficult for long-lived fishes because of crowded annuli on the margins of calcified structures due to slow growth (Campana, 2001). Systematic underestimation of fish age can lead to overestimates of growth and mortality rates (Mills & Beamish, 1980) and compromise understanding of year-class strength (Yule et al., 2008). Maximum reported ages of kiyi in earlier studies using scales were 6 years from Lake Ontario (Pritchard, 1931) and 10 years from Lake Michigan (Deason & Hile, 1947). More recent otolith-based maximum age estimates for Lake Superior kiyi were >20 years (Gorman, 2012; Pratt & Chong, 2012). These results agree with others who found that age estimates derived from otoliths and fin rays typically exceed scale-derived estimates (Maceina et al., 2007; Quist, Pegg, & DeVries, 2012). A comparison of scale and otolith-derived ages of kiyi has not been conducted, nor have the ages of deepwater ciscoes been validated, *sensu* Beamish and McFarlane (1983).

In the Laurentian Great Lakes, recruitment of *Coregonus* spp. was historically thought to be fairly regular (Dryer & Beil, 1964). This view was based on adult cisco (*C. artedi)* collections from 1950-59 and scale-derived age estimates that showed little annual variability in age-4 fish. Yule et al. (2008) showed how age underestimation associated with scale-derived ages can lead to an inaccurate understanding of Lake Superior cisco recruitment, which was later confirmed via juvenile population estimates (Hoff, 2004; Stockwell et al., 2009; Myers et al., 2015). Variability in kiyi recruitment has not been evaluated.

The purpose of this study was to 1) compare Lake Superior kiyi ages estimated from scales and otoliths, 2) assess validation of otolith-derived kiyi ages by comparing age distributions to strong year-classes identified from annual length frequency distributions, and 3) evaluate recruitment variability.

**Methods**

*Age analyses*

Fish collections were made at 102 locations throughout Lake Superior during daylight between 19 May and 20 July 2014 with the United States Geological Survey Research Vessel Kiyi using a Yankee bottom trawl with either a chain or rubber disk foot rope towed at approximately 3.5 km/h. Both nets had an 11.9 m head rope, 15.5 m foot rope, and 2.2 m wing height with stretch mesh of 89 mm at the mouth, 64 mm for the trammel, and 13 mm at the cod-end. May and June tows were made cross-contour with a mean beginning depth of 19 m (range: 11-40), ending depth of 61 m (range: 19-144), and distance covered of 1.7 km (range: 0.5-3.8). July tows followed a constant depth contour and had a mean average depth of 191 m (range: 92-315) and distance covered of 1.4 km (range: 1.2-1.5). All kiyi collected were counted, weighed in aggregate, and frozen for later processing. Relative density () and biomass () were estimated by dividing collection counts and aggregate weights by the area swept by each trawl tow.

Frozen fish were thawed at room temperature before total length to the nearest mm, weight to the nearest gram, and sex (visually determined as female, male, or juvenile) were recorded. A subsample of 10 individuals per 10 mm length bin were selected from each of five regions (Figure 1) to get a lakewide representative sample for fish between 160 and 279 mm. All kiyi <160 mm and >280 mm were aged because fish of these lengths are rare based on historical collections. Scales were removed from directly above the lateral line as close to the anterior margin of the dorsal fin as possible from either side of the fish. Scales and sagittal otoliths were placed in paper envelopes to air dry.

Otoliths were embedded in clear epoxy (Buehler EpoKwick™ Epoxy, 5:1 ratio of resin to hardener) before a 0.5-mm thick section through the nucleus along the dorsoventral plane was obtained with a Buehler IsoMet™ Low Speed Saw. Otolith thin sections were lightly polished with 1000-grit sandpaper before viewing in mineral oil on a black background with reflected light applied at approximately a 45 degree angle to the section. A digital image of each thin section, or images for some sections where all fields of the section were not clear on one image, was captured with a Nikon DS-Fi2™ camera attached to a Nikon SMZ745T™ stereo microscope. Age estimates were also obtained from scales for fish collected from the eastern Michigan region. We estimated age from scales for a limited number of fish because we expected a clear difference in age estimates from scales and otoliths as has been shown for numerous other fishes including other coregonines (e.g., Maceina et al., 2007; Yule et al., 2008; Quist et al., 2012; Stewart, Ogle, Gorman, & Vinson, 2016). Digital images were captured for scales pressed into 5-mm thick acetate slides with the same camera and microscope described for otoliths.

Two readers who were blind to any biological information related to the fish identified annuli on otoliths from the digital images. The combination of a translucent band representing fast growth and an opaque band representing slow growth on the sectioned otolith was interpreted as one year of growth. At the otolith margin, only completed opaque bands were counted as an annulus, as partial growth from the capture year was present for some individuals. After initial analyses comparing age estimates between readers (see below), the two readers further reviewed the otolith image in an attempt to achieve a consensus age estimate for analyses that required a single age estimate. Fish for which a consensus age estimate could not be achieved were removed from further analyses. One reader, who was blind to biological information about the fish, identified annuli on scales, using “cutting-over” and “compaction” characteristics evident in the circuli (Quist et al., 2012).

Bias in otolith-derived age estimates between two readers (e.g., one reader consistently estimated lower ages than the other reader) and between scale and otolith-derived age estimates from the same reader were assessed with age-bias plots (Campana, Annand, & McMillan, 1995) and the Evans and Hoenig (1995) test of symmetry for the age-agreement table (as suggested for use by McBride, 2015). If no significant bias between readers was detected for otolith-derived age estimates, then precision between readers was summarized as the percentage of fish for which the ages differed by zero or by one or fewer years and the average coefficient of variation (ACV; Chang, 1982; Kimura & Lyons, 1991). Age bias and precision metrics were computed with the ageBias and agePrecision functions, respectively, from the FSA package v0.8.11 (Ogle, 2016b) in the RTM statistical environment v3.3.2 (R Development Core Team, 2016). All statistical tests used α=0.05 to determine significance.

An age-length key (Fridriksson, 1934; Ketchen, 1949) was constructed from consensus otolith-derived age estimates. The age-length key was then used to assign specific ages to all kiyi captured in 2014 using the method described by Isermann and Knight (2005) as implemented in the alkIndivAge function from the FSA package.

*Length frequency year class identification*

Kiyi collected from the same locations and months and using the same methods were available from 2003-2014 (Vinson, Evrard, Gorman, & Yule, 2016). Length frequency distributions from these years were visually examined for evidence of strong year-classes (i.e., recruitment) which could be used to partially validate estimated ages for kiyi captured in 2014. Kiyi likely hatch at a size (10-12 mm) and time (spring) similar to cisco (Oyadomari & Auer, 2007; Oyadomari & Auer, 2008) and were likely not present as age-0 fish in these annual trawl samples. In Lake Michigan, kiyi reached a mean standard length of approximately 100 mm the following spring at age-1 (Deason & Hile, 1947). Thus, we identified clusters of fish in these annual spring and summer collections with distinct total length modes less than 110 mm total length as age-1 fish. The relative numbers of age-1 fish in these samples was used as an index for the strength of the previous year’s year-class of kiyi.

**Results**

A total of 984 kiyi were collected at 24 of the 102 locations sampled in 2014 (Figure 1). Kiyi were found at three locations between 27 May 2014 and 5 June 2014, and at 21 locations between 7 July and 20 July 2014. Biomass and density ranged from 0-12 and 0-253 , respectively. The minimum and maximum depths of capture at 21 on-contour sampling locations were 132 and 256 m. Maximum density (253 ) and biomass (12 ) were observed at 190 m. Kiyi total lengths ranged from 108-266 mm with a mean (SD) of 197 (19.3) mm.

*Age analyses*

Ages in 2014 were estimated from 288 thin-sectioned otoliths. Of these, 22 (7.6%) otoliths were deemed unreadable (cracked or cloudy image) and were removed from further consideration. There was no significant systematic bias between otolith-derived age estimates from the two readers (p = 0.445; Figure 2), though the mean estimated age for the second reader was slightly greater when the first reader estimated an age of 5 (95% CI: 5.1-5.4; p < 0.001) and slightly lower when the first reader estimated an age of 12 (95% CI: 11.1-11.8; p = 0.031). Otolith-derived age estimates from the two readers agreed perfectly for 72.6% of the fish, agreed within one year for 97.0% of the fish, and had an ACV of 2.8. Mean scale-derived age estimates for each otolith-derived age estimate was less than the otolith-derived age estimate for all observed otolith-derived age estimates (p < 0.039) except for age 4 (Figure 3).

The maximum estimated age was 20 for females and 12 for males from otoliths and 8 for females and 7 for males from scales. The distribution of otolith-derived age estimates for kiyi captured in 2014 showed distinct modes at age 11 and ages 5 and 6 (Figure 4), which correspond to the 2003, 2008, and 2009 year classes.

*Length frequency year class identification*

Examination of kiyi length frequencies from fish captured from 2003-2014 showed that clusters of fish with a mode <110 mm were present in high numbers in 2004, 2006, and 2010 and were not detected or at very low numbers in all other years (Figure 5). The fish in these clusters correspond to the 2003, 2005 and 2009 year classes, respectively. The cluster of kiyi in the 2003 year class was distinct in subsequent length-frequencies until at least 2006. In 2007, the cluster of kiyi from the 2005 year class were either not evident or had grown enough to be indistinguishable from kiyi of the 2003 year class. Kiyi from the 2009 year class were still distinct in 2010 but were either not evident or had grown enough to be indistinguishable from older fish by 2013. Only one distinct mode was evident in the length frequency from 2014.

**Discussion**

Precision between readers for thin-sectioned otoliths was very good as the ACV (2.8) was less than the 5 suggested by Campana (2001) to represent “high precision.” This result was somewhat surprising because both readers expressed difficulty interpreting putative annuli near the center of otoliths when few annuli were present (i.e., relatively young fish) and at the margin on all otoliths. Due to the sporadic production of year classes, our otolith ages from 2014 suffered from having no fish less than four years old. Without these fish, we could not develop a good understanding for the appearance of the first few annuli. Interpretation of the otolith margin is notoriously difficult (Campana, 2001) and because our samples were restricted to two days in early June and a few days in the middle of July, we were not able to examine the otolith margin throughout the May through September growing season to develop a better understanding of its appearance. However, length frequency distributions for three other years when kiyi were sampled in several months suggested that substantial growth in length of kiyi in Lake Superior was not evident until at least late July. This suggests that we should have seen little current season’s growth on the otolith thin sections in our sample. However, 21% and 36% of the otoliths were categorized by reader 1 and reader 2, respectively, as having evidence for growth in the current season.

Kiyi ages estimated from otoliths were consistently greater than ages estimated from scales (Figure 3). This is consistent with previous results for Lake Superior cisco (Yule et al., 2008) and Lake Superior pygmy whitefish (*Prosopium coulteri*; Stewart et al., 2016), Canadian lake whitefish (*C. clupeaformis*; Mills & Beamish, 1980; Barnes & Power, 1984) and round whitefish *(Prosopium cylindraceum*, Jessop, 1972), European vendace (*C. albula,* Aass, 1972), as well as for many other fish (Maceina et al., 2007; Quist et al., 2012). Our maximum otolith-derived age estimates of 20 for females and 12 for males compares similarly to Pratt and Chong (2012) who observed maximum otolith-derived age estimates of 22 for females and 16 for males from kiyi collected in Canadian waters of Lake Superior and Gorman (2012) who reported Lake Superior kiyi life spans as >20 years. These ages are similar to the maximum otolith-derived age estimates for Lake Superior cisco (21 for female and 17 for male; Yule et al., 2008).

Kiyi length frequency distributions from 2003-2014 appear to partially validate our otolith-derived age estimates. Visual examination of length frequencies from 2003-2014 revealed strong year classes of kiyi in 2003, 2005, and 2009, with little to no recruitment in other years. Our otolith-derived age estimates from 2014 were generally within one year of the ages for these year classes, with the exception of the 2009 year class. The lack of stronger presence of age-9 fish, the 2005 year class, in our 2014 age analysis could be attributed to the apparent smaller size of that year class as compared to that observed for the 2003 and 2009 year classes.

From these findings, it appears kiyi age may be reliably estimated to within one year by examination of thin-sectioned otoliths. Ageing error may be reduced with a better understanding of the characteristics of the first few annuli and the appearance of the otolith margin. We recommend extracting otoliths from small (young) kiyi in years when they are present and from kiyi collected throughout the open-water growing season when feasible. Continued annual collections of length frequency data, along with otoliths from these fish, will also allow researchers to further validate age estimates from otoliths for kiyi. Because otoliths appear to provide an accurate estimate of age and age estimates from scales were less than that from otoliths for all otolith ages, we recommend that scales no longer be used to estimate the age of kiyi.

The annual length frequency distributions suggest that kiyi experience high interannual variability in recruitment. Only three strong year-classes were observed at age-1 from 2003-2014. Variable recruitment has been observed in other *Coregonus* spp. (e.g., *C. albula*, Axenrot & Degerman, 2015; *C. artedi*, Hoff, 2004; Stockwell et al., 2009; Myers et al., 2015; *C. autumnalis*, Fechhelm & Fissel, 1988; Fechhelm & Griffiths, 1990; *C. hoyi*, Bunnell Madenjian, & Croley, 2006; Bunnell et al., 2010; Gorman, 2012; Collingsworth, Bunnell, Madenjian, & Riley, 2014; *C. kiyi* and *C. zenithicus*, Gorman, 2012). The strong kiyi year classes in 2003, 2005, and 2009 correspond to higher than average year classes of Lake Superior bloater (*C. hoyi*) and cisco (Stockwell et al., 2009; Yule et al., 2008; more recent data in Vinson et al., 2016). Recruitment synchrony has also been observed within bloater (Bunnell et al., 2006; Bunnell et al., 2010) and cisco (Myers et al., 2015) populations across the Great Lakes and in Europe (Sandström, Ragnarsson-Stabo, Axenrot, & Bergstrand, 2014). Hypothesized factors underlying *Coregonus* spp. year class strength variation includes density-independent physical environmental factors such as annual weather patterns that affect larval fishes directly or their food (Axenrot & Degerman, 2015), density-dependent biotic factors (e.g., predation by or competition with rainbow smelt (Myers et al., 2015)) or spawner sex ratios (Bunnell et al., 2006), or a combination of these factors. Synchrony among disjunct populations and between species in the same region supports the idea that environmental factors such as winter ice conditions, spring ice break-up date, and wind play a major role in determining *Coregonus* spp. year-class strength.

Our results indicate that Lake Superior kiyi are long-lived and exhibit sporadic recruitment that may be synchronous with recruitment patterns exhibited by other *Coregonus* spp. The critical period for survival (*sensu* Hjort, 1914; Houde, 2008) appears to be <age-1 as distinct year classes observed at age-1 appeared to survive to older ages. While currently not commercially or recreationally valuable like some *Coregonus* spp., kiyi are a key trophic link between zooplankton and lake trout, the top native predator in the Great Lakes (Gamble, Hrabik, Stockwell, & Yule, 2011), which is a commercially and recreationally important species. Successful restoration of deepwater ciscoes in the other Great Lakes may depend on understanding their life histories (Zimmerman & Krueger, 2009). Additionally, Lake Superior is a refuge for many cold stenothermic species like kiyi, which is currently listed as vulnerable on Canada’s Endangered Species List (Turgeon & Bernatchez, 2003). Increased study of and long-term monitoring of kiyi and other cisco species, including age, growth, diet, and recruitment characteristics, may provide insight into how climate change may affect the deepwater fish fauna of Lake Superior and elsewhere.

**Acknowledgements**

The R/V Kiyi vessel crew (Charles Carrier, Lori Evrard, Dalton Lebeda, Keith Peterson, and Joe Walters) assisted with fish collections. Matt Belnap assisted with initial otolith preparation. Lori Evrard assisted with data management and presentation. Any use of trade, product, or firm names is for descriptive purposes only and does not imply endorsement by the U.S. Government.

**References**

Aass, P. (1972). Age determination and year-class fluctuation of cisco, *Coregonus albula* L., in the Mjøsa hydroelectric reservoir. *Reports of the Institute of Fresh-water Research Drottningholm*, **52**, 5-22.

Axenrot, T., & Degerman, E. (2015). Year-class strength, physical fitness and recruitment cycles in vendace (*Coregonus albula*). *Fisheries Research*, **173**, 61-69.

Barnes, M. A., & Power, G. (1984). A comparison of otolith and scale ages for western Labrador lake whitefish, *Coregonus clupeaformis*. *Environmental Biology of Fishes,* **10**, 297–299*.*

Beamish, R. J., & McFarlane, G. A. (1983). The forgotten requirement for age validation in fisheries biology. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society,* **112**, 735-743.

Bunnell, D. B., Madenjian, C. P., & Croley II, T. E. (2006). Long-term trends of bloater (*Coregonus hoyi*) recruitment in Lake Michigan: evidence for the effect of sex ratio. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, **63**, 832-844.

Bunnell, D. B., Adams, J. V., Gorman, O. T., Madenjian, C. P., Riley, S. C., Roseman, E. F., & Schaeffer, J. S. (2010). Population synchrony of a native fish across three Laurentian Great Lakes: evaluating the effects of dispersal and climate. *Oecologia*, **162**, 641-651.

Campana, S. E., Annand, M. C., & McMillan, J. I. (1995). Graphical and statistical methods for determining the consistency of age determinations. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, **124**, 131-138.

Campana, S. E. (2001). Accuracy, precision and quality control in age determination, including a review of the use and abuse of age validation methods. *Journal of Fish Biology*, **59**, 197-242.

Chang, W. Y. B. (1982). A statistical method for evaluating the reproducibility of age determination. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, **39**, 1208-1210.

Christie, W. J. (1974). Changes in the fish species composition of the Great Lakes. *Journal of Fisheries Research Board of Canada*, **31**, 827-854.

Collingsworth, P. D., Bunnell, D. B., Madenjian, C. P., & Riley, S. C. (2014). Comparative recruitment dynamics of alewife and bloater in Lakes Michigan and Huron. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, **143**, 294-309.

Deason, H. J., & Hile, R. (1947). Age and growth of the kiyi, *Leucichthys kiyi* Koelz, in Lake Michigan. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, **74**, 553-572.

Dryer, W. R., & Beil, J. (1964). Life history of lake herring in Lake Superior. *Fishery Bulletin*, **63**, 493-530.

Evans, G. T., & Hoenig, J. M. (1995). Analysing differences between two age determination methods by tests of symmetry. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, **52**, 364-368.

Fechhelm, R. G., & Fissel, D. B. (1988). Wind-aided recruitment of Canadian Arctic cisco (*Coregonus autumnalis*) into Alaskan waters. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, **45**, 906-910.

Fechhelm, R. G., & Griffiths, W. B. (1990). Effect of wind on the recruitment of Canadian Arctic cisco (*Coregonus autumnalis*) into the central Alaskan Beaufort Sea. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, **47**, 2164-2171.

Fridriksson, A. (1934). On the calculation of age-distribution within a stock of cod by means of relatively few age-determinations as a key to measurements on a large scale. *Rapports et Proces-verbaux des Réunions. Conseil International pour l'Éxploration de la Mer*, **86**, 1-5.

Gamble, A. E., Hrabik, T. R., Stockwell, J. D., & Yule, D. L. (2011). Trophic connections in Lake Superior Part I: The offshore fish community. *Journal of Great Lakes Research*, **37**, 541-549.

Gorman, O. T. (2012). Successional Change in the Lake Superior Fish Community: Population Trends in Ciscoes, Rainbow Smelt, and Lake Trout, 1958-2008. *Advances in Limnology*, **63**, 337-362.

Haddon, M. (2011). *Modelling and Quantitative Methods in Fisheries* (2nd ed.). Boca Raton, FL: Chapman & Hall/CRC Press.

Hjort, J. (1914). Fluctuations in the great fisheries of northern Europe viewed in the light of biological research. *Rapports et Proces-verbaux des Réunions. Conseil International pour l'Éxploration de la Mer*, **20**, 1–228.

Hoff, M. H. (2004). Biotic and abiotic factors related to lake herring recruitment in the Wisconsin waters of Lake Superior, 1984–1998. *Journal of Great Lakes Research*, **30**, 423-433.

Houde, E. D. (2008). Emerging from Hjort’s shadow. *Journal of Northwest Atlantic Fishery Science*, **41**, 53-70.

Jessop, B. M. 1972. Aging round whitefish (*Prosopium cylindraceum*) of the Leaf River, Ungava, Quebec, by otoliths. *Journal of the Fisheries Research Board of Canada*,**29**, 452-454.

Ketchen, K. S. (1949). Stratified subsampling for determining age distributions. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, **79**, 205-212.

Kimura, D. K., & Lyons, J. J. (1991). Between reader bias and variability in age-determination process. *Fishery Bulletin*, **89**, 53-60.

Koelz, W. N. (1927). Coregonid fishes of the Great Lakes. *United States Bureau of Fisheries*, **43**, 297-643.

Maceina, M. J., Boxrucker, J., Bueckmeier, D. L., Gangl, R. S., Lucchesi, D. O., Isermann, D. A., Jackson, J. R., & Martinez, P. J. (2007). Current status and review of freshwater fish aging procedures used by state and provincial fisheries agencies with recommendations for future directions. *Fisheries*, **32**, 329-340.

McBride, R. S. (2015). Diagnosis of paired age agreement: A simulation approach of accuracy and precision effects. *ICES Journal of Marine Science*, **72**, 2149-2167.

Mills, K. H., & Beamish, R. J. (1980). Comparison of fin-ray and scale age determinations for lake whitefish (*Coregonus clupeaformis*) and their implications for estimates of growth and annual survival. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, **37**, 534–544.

Myers, J. T., Yule, D. L., Jones, M. I., Ahrenstorff, T. D., Hrabik, T. R., Claramunt, R. M., Ebener, M. P., & Berglund, E. K. (2015). Spatial synchrony in cisco recruitment. *Fishery Research*, **165**, 11-21.

Ogle, D. H. (2016a). Introductory Fisheries Analysis. Boca Raton, FL: R. Chapman & Hall/CRC Press.

Ogle, D. H. (2016b). FSA: Fisheries stock analysis. Available from: http://github.com/droglenc/fsa/.

Oyadomari, J. K., & Auer, N. A. (2007). Influence of rearing temperature and feeding regime on otolith increment deposition of larval ciscoes. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, **136**, 766-777.

Oyadomari, J. K., & Auer, N. A. (2008). Transport and growth of larval cisco (*Coregonus artedi*) in the Keweenaw Current region of Lake Superior. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences*, **65**, 1447-1458.

Parker, B. J. (1989). Status of the kiyi, *Coregonus kiyi*, in Canada. *Canadian Field-Naturalist*, **103**, 171-174.

Pratt, T. C., & Chong, S. C. (2012). Contemporary life history characteristics of Lake Superior deepwater ciscoes. *Aquatic Ecosystem Health and Management*, **15**, 322-332.

Prichard, A. L. (1931). Taxonomic and life history studies of the ciscoes of Lake Ontario. University of Toronto Press and Ontario Fisheries Research Laboratory. No. 41. 78 pages.

Quist, M. C., Pegg, M. A., & DeVries, D. R. (2012). Age and growth. In Zale, A.V., Parrish, D. L., Sutton, T. M., (Eds.) *Fisheries Techniques* (pp. 677-731) (3rd ed.). American Fisheries Society, Bethesda, MD.

R Development Core Team, 2016. R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing. Available from: http://R-project.org.

Sandström, A., Ragnarsson-Stabo, H., Axenrot, T., & Bergstrand, E. (2014). Has climate variability driven the trends and dynamics in recruitment of pelagic fish species in Swedish Lakes Vänern and Vättern in recent decades? *Aquatic Ecosystem Health and Management*, **17**, 349-356.

Stewart, T. R., Ogle, D. H., Gorman, O. T., & Vinson, M. R. (2016). Age, growth, and size of Lake Superior Pygmy Whitefish (*Prosopium coulterii*). *The American Midland Naturalist Journal*, **175**, 24-36.

Stockwell, J. D., Ebener, M. P., Black, J. A., Gorman, O. T., Hrabik, T. R., Kinnunen, R. E., Mattes, W. P., Oyadomari, J. K., Schram, S. T., Schreiner, D. R., Seider, M. J., Sitar, S. P., & Yule, D. L. (2009). A synthesis of cisco recovery in Lake Superior: implications for native fish rehabilitation in the Laurentian Great Lakes. *North American Journal of Fisheries Management*, **29**, 626-652.

Turgeon, J., & Bernatchez, L. (2003). Reticulate evolution and phenotypic diversity in North American ciscoes, *Coregonus* ssp. (Teleostei: Salmonidae): implications for the conservation of an evolutionary legacy. *Conservation Genetics*, **4**, 67-81.

Vinson, M. R., Evrard, L. M., Gorman, O. T., & Yule, D. L. (2016). Compiled Reports to the Great Lakes Fishery Commission of the Annual Bottom Trawl and Acoustics Surveys, 2015, Ann Arbor, MI, pp. 86-96. Available from <http://www.glfc.org/lakecom/common_docs/Compiled%20Reports%20from%20USGS%202016.pdf> accessed 15 November 2016.

Yule, D. L., Stockwell, J. D., Black, J. A., Cullis, K. I., Cholwek, G. A., & Myers, J. T. (2008). How systematic age underestimation can impede understanding of fish population dynamics: Lessons learned from a Lake Superior cisco stock. *Transactions of the American Fisheries Society*, **137**, 481-495.

Yule, D. L., Adams, J. V., Hrabik, T. R., Vinson, M. R., Woiak, Z., & Ahrenstorff, T. D. (2013). Use of classification trees to apportion single echo detections to species: application to the pelagic fish community of Lake Superior. *Fishery Research*, **140**, 123-132.

Zimmerman, M. S., & Krueger, C. C. (2009). An ecosystem perspective on re-establishing native deepwater fishes in the Laurentian Great Lakes. *North American Journal of Fisheries Management*, **29**, 1352-1371.

**Figure Captions**

Figure 1. Sampling locations in Lake Superior in 2014 with five regions used for subsampling kiyi for age estimation identified. Solid symbols denote locations where kiyi were collected.

Figure 2. Difference in otolith-derived age estimates for Lake Superior kiyi from two readers at otolith-derived age estimates for the first reader (i.e., a modified age-bias plot), with mean (short horizontal lines) and 95% confidence intervals (vertical lines). Darker points represent more individuals. The horizontal dashed line represents ages that agreed and confidence intervals that do not intersect this line represent otolith-derived age estimates that differed significantly between readers. Sample sizes for each otolith-derived age estimate for the first reader are shown above the x-axis.

Figure 3. Difference in scale and otolith-derived age estimates for Lake Superior kiyi at otolith-derived age estimates for one reader (i.e, a modified age-bias plot), with mean (short horizontal lines) and 95% confidence intervals (vertical lines). Darker points represent more individuals. The horizontal dashed line represents scale and otolith ages that agreed and confidence intervals that do not intersect this line represent differences between scale and otolith-derived age estimates.. Sample sizes for each otolith-derived age estimate are shown above the x-axis.

Figure 4. Relative frequency of otolith-derived age estimates for all Lake Superior kiyi captured from May-July 2014. Ages were expanded from an age-length key based on consensus (between two readers) otolith-derived age estimates.

Figure 5. Relative within-year frequency of total length for all kiyi captured in Lake Superior from May-July 2003-2014. Plots are labeled with the year sampled and the total sample size. Each plot has been scaled such that the mode has a height equal to 1. The numeric labels in 2004, 2006, and 2010 are the age of fish in those modes in 2014. The vertical dashed line in each plot is at 110 mm which was used to identify the total length mode for age-1 fish.







